

FINAL REPORT

FY2010 TRIENNIAL REVIEW

of the

**San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency
(SFMTA)**

Recipient ID: 1697

Desk Review: December 2, 2009

Site Visit: May 24-27, 2010

June 2010

**Prepared for the
Federal Transit Administration
Region IX
San Francisco, California**

by

CDI/DCI Joint Venture

Table of Contents

I.	TRIENNIAL REVIEW BACKGROUND	1
II.	REVIEW PROCESS.....	1
III.	DESCRIPTION OF THE GRANTEE	2
IV.	RESULTS OF THE REVIEW	7
	1. Legal	7
	2. Financial	7
	3. Technical	7
	4. Satisfactory Continuing Control.....	7
	5. Maintenance	8
	6. Procurement.....	8
	7. Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE)	8
	8. Buy America.....	9
	9. Debarment and Suspension	9
	10. Lobbying.....	9
	11. Planning/Program of Projects.....	9
	12. Title VI	10
	13. Fare Increases and Major Service Reductions.....	10
	14. Half Fare	10
	15. ADA	11
	16. Charter Bus.....	11
	17. School Bus.....	11
	18. National Transit Database (NTD)	11
	19. Safety and Security	12
	20. Drug-Free Workplace	13
	21. Drug and Alcohol Program	13
	22. Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO)	13
	23. ITS Architecture	13
	24. American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA).....	14
V.	SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND CORRECTIVE ACTIONS	15
VI.	TRANSIT SECURITY EXPENDITURES.....	17
VII.	ATTENDEES	18

I. TRIENNIAL REVIEW BACKGROUND

The United States Code, chapter 53 of title 49, requires the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) of the United States Department of Transportation (USDOT) to perform reviews and evaluations of Urbanized Area Formula Grant activities at least every three years. This requirement is contained in 49 U.S.C. 5307(i).

- (2) At least once every three years, the Secretary shall review and evaluate completely the performance of a recipient in carrying out the recipient's program, specifically referring to compliance with statutory and administrative requirements and the extent to which actual program activities are consistent with the activities proposed under subsection (d) of this section and the planning process required under sections 5303-5306 of this title.
- (3) The Secretary may take appropriate action consistent with the review, audit and evaluation under this subsection, including making an appropriate adjustment in the amount of a grant or withdrawing the grant.

The Triennial Review includes a review of the grantee's compliance in 24 areas. The basic requirements for each of these areas are summarized below.

This report presents the findings from the Triennial Review of the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) of San Francisco, California. This review was performed in accordance with FTA procedures (published in FTA Order 9010.1B, April 5, 1993) and included preliminary reviews of documents on file at the Region IX Office in San Francisco and on-site discussions and review of the procedures, practices, and records of SFMTA as deemed necessary. The review concentrated primarily on procedures and practices employed during the past three years; however, coverage was extended to earlier periods as needed to assess the policies in place and the management of grants. During the site visit, administrative and statutory requirements were discussed, documents were reviewed, and facilities were toured. Specific documents examined during the Triennial Review are available in FTA's and SFMTA's files.

II. REVIEW PROCESS

The desk review was conducted in the Region IX Office on December 2, 2009. Following the desk review, a review package was sent to SFMTA advising it of the site visit and indicating additional information that would be needed and issues that would be discussed.

The site visit to San Francisco occurred on May 24-27, 2010. The individuals participating in the review are listed in Section VII of this report.

At the entrance conference, the purpose of the Triennial Review and the review process were discussed. During the site visit, administrative and statutory requirements were discussed and documents were reviewed. SFMTA's transit facilities were toured to provide an overview of activities related to FTA-funded projects. A sample of maintenance records for FTA-funded vehicles, facilities, and equipment was examined during the site visit.

Upon completion of the review, an exit conference was held with SFMTA staff to discuss findings, corrective actions, and schedules. This information is summarized in the table in Section V of this report. A draft copy of this report was provided to SFMTA at the exit conference.

III. DESCRIPTION OF THE GRANTEE

The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, originally the Municipal Railway or Muni, began service in 1912 as one of the first publicly owned and operated transit systems in the United States. From 1932 until 1994, MUNI was governed by the City's Public Utilities Commission (PUC). Following this period, the transit service had several changes in its structure and governance. In 1993, Proposition M was passed by San Francisco voters creating the Public Transportation Commission (PTC) and the Public Transportation Department (PTD). Muni was made part of the PTD and came under control of the PTC in 1994. In 1999, the voters of San Francisco passed a charter amendment, known as Proposition E, which consolidated Muni and the Division of Parking and Traffic (DPT) into a new Municipal Transportation Agency. SFMTA now consists of the Municipal Railway, the DPT, and the Division of Taxis and Accessible Services (DTAS). The SFMTA is governed by a seven-member Board of Directors appointed by the Mayor of San Francisco. Four of the board members must be regular riders of the transit system, and all members must ride the system at least on average once a week. The Board sets policy, approves the budget, and hires the Executive Director.

SFMTA provides transit service within the City and County of San Francisco. The population of the service area is approximately 750,000 persons. The SFMTA fleet, one of the most diverse in the transit industry, includes historic streetcars, modern light rail vehicles, diesel buses, alternative fuel vehicles, electric trolley coaches, and the iconic San Francisco cable cars. Diesel and hybrid bus service is provided on 59 routes. Muni Metro light rail subway service operates on seven routes. There are 14 routes served by electric trolley buses. The cable cars operate on three lines.

SFMTA directly operates all fixed route service and contracts with Veolia Transportation to manage paratransit service. Veolia acts as a broker, contracting with van and taxi operators to provide service known as San Francisco Paratransit.

SFMTA's extensive paratransit program has a long history predating ADA complementary paratransit requirements. The program includes three primary services that are available to all ADA-eligible persons:

- SF Access is an advance reservation system that uses vans to provide origin to destination ADA-compliant shared ride service.

- Taxi and Ramped Taxi service offers ADA-eligible persons same-day access to all taxis in San Francisco. Users have a monthly allocation of service and pay a subsidized fare using a debit card. This is the largest of the SFMTA’s three paratransit services, providing 55 percent of the trips.
- Group Van service provides routine, pre-scheduled group trips transporting ADA-eligible clients to and from programs of approximately 35 San Francisco human service agencies.

Muni operates 24 hours per day, seven days per week, with reduced service levels on “owl lines” available between 1 a.m. and 5 a.m. The basic adult fare for fixed route bus, streetcar, and light rail service is \$2.00. A reduced fare of \$0.75 is offered to seniors, persons with disabilities, and Medicare card holders during all service hours. Cable car service and special express routes such as service to Candlestick Park for 49ers football games are \$5.00. The fare for ADA paratransit service is \$2.00. The taxi program provides \$30 worth of service for a \$5.00 payment.

SFMTA operates a fleet of 460 diesel buses and 313 trolley buses for fixed-route bus service. The fleet includes 30-, 40-, and 60-foot standard, low-floor, and articulated transit coaches. In addition, SFMTA operates 151 light rail vehicles for the Metro subway, 24 historic streetcars, and 40 cable cars. The current peak requirement is 373 diesel buses and 230 trolleys. SFMTA also has a fleet of 60 vans that are leased to Veolia for San Francisco Paratransit service.

SFMTA’s administrative headquarters is at One South Van Ness Avenue in San Francisco. Transit facilities include six bus garages, four rail facilities, and the cable car barn. In addition, SFMTA has a facilities maintenance shop, a non-revenue vehicle facility, the operations control center, and a warehouse.

SFMTA’s National Transit Database Report for FY2009 provided the following financial and operating statistics for its fixed-route and paratransit services:

	Motor Bus	Cable Car	Light Rail	Trolley Bus	Paratransit
Unlinked Passengers	95,190,296	7,425,205	50,312,720	72,142,492	1,140,049
Revenue Hours	1,528,423	146,190	465,399	1,010,048	331,777
Operating Expenses	\$237,166,251	\$55,825,735	\$156,466,590	\$140,633,398	\$20,401,201

The economic downturn beginning in 2008 has led to decreased tax revenues for transit service while demand for services has continued to increase. Additionally, the California state budget crisis resulted in a loss of \$180 million in anticipated funding. To balance the FY 2010 budget, the SFMTA implemented several fare and service changes in 2009 and again in 2010. The SFMTA board is considering additional measures to reduce costs and increase revenues in order to prepare a balanced 2011-2012 operating budget.

Over the past three years, SFMTA completed the following projects:

- Third Street Light Rail Transit Project, Phase I (\$648M), consists of the construction of a new 5.4-mile long light rail transit line and 13-acre Metro East light rail vehicle maintenance and storage facilities located at 25th and Illinois Streets. Completed in September 2008.
- Metro Subway overhead reconstruction project (\$16M) replaced the overhead catenary system in the Market Street Subway and in the Twin Peaks tunnel. Completed in March 2008.
- Presidio Yard overhead reconstruction project (\$5M) replaced the overhead catenary system inside the 2.3 acre coach storage yard and replaced a number of the overhead line poles. Completed in 2008.
- West Portal rail replacement project (\$11M) replaced the half grand union and the associated overhead catenary system at the West Portal intersection along with crossover tracks on an adjoining street. Completed in July 2008.
- The Integrated Automatic Vehicle Location System (\$14M) project implemented a Global Positioning System (GPS) based real-time information and vehicle location system for all of Muni's revenue modes. Completed in August 2009.
- 33-Stanyan Overhead Replacement project (\$10M) replaced trolley wires, overhead special work, deteriorated trolley poles, and other hardware. The work also included construction of a new ductbank and manholes to move overhead-fed power lines underground. The contract was awarded in January 2009 and substantial completion was in March 2010.

The following projects are ongoing:

- Central Subway (\$1.6B), Phase 2 of the the Third Street Light Rail Transit Project, is a 1.7-mile extension of the light rail into Chinatown. It will include one surface station (Brannan) and three underground stations: Moscone Station, Union Square/Market Street Station, and the Chinatown Station. Three final design contracts have been prepared. Notice to proceed on the first contract for the tunnel design was given in January 2010. Notice to proceed for the second contract (the stations design) and for the third contract (the systems design) is forecast for 2010.
- Islais Creek Bus Maintenance Facility (\$57M) includes a new bus maintenance and operations yard to be located on 5.3 acres of City-owned land and 2.4 acres of Caltrans property at 1301 Cesar Chavez Street. The new bus yard will include parking for Muni motor coaches and non-revenue vehicles, and facilities for operations, maintenance, and administration. The completed design package for Phase I Site Development was advertised and bids were opened in February of 2010. Multiple bid protests and problems with more than half the bid packages led to a need to re-bid the project. Construction is planned to begin in late 2010. Phase II to design the Maintenance and Operation building is dependent on future funding.
- ITS Radio Project (\$87M) will design and construct a new radio communication system for the SFMTA. The current system is 30 years old and is obsolete. The new system will meet ITS standards and will include transit management, transit signal priority, automatic passengers counters, digital voice annunciation, vehicle health monitoring, and data/information monitoring. In March 2010 the selection committee

- prequalified two proposers. Contract award is scheduled for September 2010. Project completion is scheduled for 2013.
- Woods Lifts Replacement (\$6M) will replace eight to ten lifts in the heavy duty maintenance area. The Conceptual Engineering Report will be completed in June 2010 and detail design will be completed in December 2010.
 - Duboce and Church Rail Replacement (\$25M) will replace worn track, including special trackwork, for the N and J Lines on Duboce Avenue between Church and Noe Streets and on Church Street between Duboce Avenue and Market Street. The project will also replace and upgrade the Wayside Train Control System and worn out overhead wires and poles at selected locations. Other City Departments will add water and sewer upgrades and pavement work to the project to minimize future disruption to the neighborhood. Detailed design is nearing completion and the project will be advertised in 2010.
 - Feeder Circuit Upgrade Project Phase 2 (\$11M) evaluated the traction power feeder system to determine needed improvements to the power feeder circuit network. The construction project will replace and upgrade eleven circuits that disperse power from 21 substations to the seventeen trolley coach and seven light rail lines. The contract was awarded in April 2009 and construction is forecast to be completed in 2010.
 - Station E And Richmond Substation Upgrades (\$16M) evaluated substations to determine needed improvements for reliability and reduced maintenance. The construction contract will replace and upgrade the electric power equipment and physical plant of the Station E and Richmond Substations. The contract was awarded in November 2009 and construction is forecast to be completed in 2011.
 - Cable Car Propulsion System Controller Replacement project (\$12M) will upgrade the outdated 20-year old direct current (DC) motor drives and associated equipment to reduce maintenance and improve reliability, safety, and quality service for California, Powell-Mason, and Powell-Hyde Cable Car Lines. Detailed design was completed in August 2009 and the contract was awarded January 2010. Forecast construction completion date is 2011.
 - California Cable Car Infrastructure Improvements project (\$20M) is to rehabilitate or replace the vital circuit wiring along the California Street cable car line. While this work is being done, drainage improvements and deferred work will also be performed on the California Street line. Detailed design was completed in March 2010, with the contract to be awarded 2010 and construction completed in 2011.
 - Geneva Historic Car Enclosure project (\$12M) is to construct an enclosure to protect 24 historic streetcars from inclement weather. The enclosure will extend across six tracks in the Geneva streetcar yard. The design/build contract was awarded in August 2008. Substantial completion is forecast for February 2011.
 - Green Center Track Replacement (\$39M) will replace worn track and special trackwork within the storage yard, upgrade the overhead contact system, upgrade the electrical system and lighting and construct an ADA boarding platform for the J and K lines. The conceptual engineering report was completed in October 2009. Detail design is underway and is forecast for completion in December 2010.
 - Van Ness Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) (\$118M) will extend along Van Ness Avenue from Mission and South Van Ness to Lombard and Van Ness. The San Francisco

County Transportation Authority (SFCTA) was the lead on the feasibility study and will lead the EIS/EIR phase of work. SFMTA provided technical assistance and support to the SFCTA-led effort. Once environmental review is completed, leadership of the project will transition to SFMTA. SFMTA will oversee the design, construction, and implementation of the new BRT service. Release of DEIS/DEIR forecast for late 2010. The new service is tentatively expected to begin in late 2014.

The following projects are planned for the next three to five years:

- Geary Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) (\$200M) consists of two segments. The completed Segment I of the project consisted of the transit improvements on Geary/O'Farrell Streets between Van Ness Avenue and Market Street. Segment II of the project, the Geary BRT Feasibility Study, is nearing completion after approximately two years of effort. Once environmental review is completed, SFMTA will oversee the design, construction, and implementation of the new BRT service. Work is ongoing for the EIR/EIS. The Geary BRT Alternatives Screening Report was issued in May 2009. The Draft EIS/EIR is tentatively projected to be completed in late 2010. Service start-up is scheduled for 2016.
- Central Control And Communications (C3) Program (\$278M) consists of several separate projects for systems replacement, facility and communications upgrades, enhancements to an interim location that will become a long term secondary backup facility, and construction of a new primary Central Control facility. The project is to be completed by December 2015 and will include a full business process review of staffing, processes, and protocols.

ARRA Projects

SFMTA has two active ARRA grants. Grant CA-96-X014 is funding:

- Automatic Train Control System inductive loop cable replacement
- Bus yard work station replacements
- Infrastructure and facility enhancement and maintenance
- Capital planning and grant management software
- Preventive maintenance
- Motor coach component life-cycle rehabilitation
- Track switch replacement
- Subway station change machine replacement
- Cable car sales kiosk replacement
- Procurement and installation of Central Control Interim Line Management equipment
- Subway fare collection system replacement
- LRV doors and steps reconditioning
- LRV truck rebuilding

Grant CA-66-X008 is for general preventive maintenance.

IV. RESULTS OF THE REVIEW

The Triennial Review focused on SFMTA's compliance in 24 areas. This section provides a discussion of the basic requirements and findings in each area. No deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements in 21 of the 24 areas. Deficiencies were found in the areas of Maintenance, Half-fare, and the Drug and Alcohol Program. In addition, advisory comments were made in the Safety and Security area. There were no repeat deficiencies from the last review. In response to the draft report, SFMTA submitted documentation to close the Half-fare and Drug and Alcohol findings.

1. Legal

Basic Requirement: The grantee must be eligible and authorized under state and local law to request, receive, and dispense FTA funds and to execute and administer FTA funded projects. The authority to take all necessary action and responsibility on behalf of the grantee must be properly delegated and executed.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for legal.

2. Financial

Basic Requirement: The grantee must demonstrate the ability to match and manage FTA grant funds, cover cost increases and operating deficits, financially maintain and operate FTA funded facilities and equipment, and conduct and respond to applicable audits.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for financial.

3. Technical

Basic Requirement: The grantee must be able to implement the FTA-funded projects in accordance with the grant application, Master Agreement, and all applicable laws and regulations, using sound management practices.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for technical.

4. Satisfactory Continuing Control

Basic Requirement: The grantee must maintain control over real property, facilities, and equipment and ensure that they are used in transit service.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for satisfactory continuing control.

5. Maintenance

Basic Requirement: Grantees and their subrecipients must keep Federally funded equipment and facilities in good operating order and maintain ADA accessibility features.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for maintenance. The Overhead Lines Department has various inspection programs to ensure the safety and reliability of the catenary lines. The program includes weekly inspections of “special work” sections; annual visual inspections from the ground of all lines; preventive maintenance inspections of LRV lines every six months; and preventive maintenance inspections of trolley bus lines annually. A review of a sample of the inspection reports showed that weekly inspections are being completed approximately 95 percent on time. As for the six-month and two annual inspections, the SFMTA was completing all of the inspections, however, significantly fewer than 80 percent of these inspections were completed on time. FTA has set a standard of completing 80 percent of the inspections within the designated time period.

Corrective Action(s) and Schedule: By September 24, 2010, SFMTA must submit to FTA three months of preventive maintenance records for overhead wire and visual ground inspections showing that 80 percent of these inspections have been completed on time.

6. Procurement

Basic Requirement: FTA grantees use their own procurement procedures that reflect applicable state and local laws and regulations, provided that the process ensures competitive procurement and the procedures conform to applicable Federal law, including 49 CFR Part 18 (specifically Section 18.36) and FTA Circular 4220.1F, “Third Party Contracting Guidance.”

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for procurement.

7. Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE)

Basic Requirement: The grantee must comply with 49 CFR Part 26 to ensure nondiscrimination in the award and administration of DOT-assisted contracts. Grantees also must create a level playing field on which DBEs can compete fairly for DOT-assisted contracts.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with USDOT requirements for DBE.

8. Buy America

Basic Requirement: Federal funds may not be obligated unless steel, iron, and manufactured products used in FTA funded projects are produced in the United States. The only exceptions are if FTA has granted a waiver or if the product is subject to a general waiver. Rolling stock must have sixty percent domestic content. Also, final assembly of rolling stock must take place in the United States and grantees must conduct a pre-award and post-delivery audit for purchases of rolling stock in order to verify that the 60 percent domestic content and final assembly requirements were met.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Buy America.

9. Debarment and Suspension

Basic Requirement: To protect the public interest from and prevent fraud, waste, and abuse in Federal transactions, persons or entities, which by defined events or behavior, that potentially threaten the integrity of Federally administered non-procurement programs, are excluded from participating in FTA assisted programs.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for debarment and suspension.

10. Lobbying

Basic Requirement: Recipients of Federal grants and contracts exceeding \$100,000 must certify compliance with Restrictions on Lobbying before they can receive funds.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for lobbying.

11. Planning/Program of Projects

Basic Requirement: The grantee must participate in the transportation planning process in accordance with FTA requirements, SAFETEA-LU, and the metropolitan and statewide planning regulations.

Grantees must develop and/or participate in a locally developed, coordinated public transit-human services transportation plan that identifies the transportation needs of individuals with disabilities, older adults, and people with low incomes, provides strategies for meeting those local needs, and prioritizes transportation services for funding and implementation.

Each recipient of a Section 5307 grant shall have complied with the public participation requirements of Section 5307(c)(1) through (7). Each grantee is required to develop, publish,

afford an opportunity for a public hearing on, and submit for approval a Program of Projects (POP).

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for planning/POP.

12. Title VI

Basic Requirement: The grantee must ensure that no person in the United States shall, on the grounds of race, color, or national origin, be excluded from participating in, be denied the benefits of, or be subject to discrimination under any program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance. The grantee must ensure that Federally supported transit services and related benefits are distributed in an equitable manner.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Title VI.

13. Fare Increases and Major Service Reductions

Basic Requirement: Section 5307 grantees are expected to have a written locally developed process for soliciting and considering public comment before raising a fare or carrying out a major transportation service reduction.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for fare increases and service reductions.

14. Half Fare

Basic Requirement: During non-peak hours for fixed route service supported with Section 5307 assistance, fares charged elderly persons, persons with disabilities, or an individual presenting a Medicare card will not be more than half the peak hour fare.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for half fare. The SFMTA provides fare information on its web site, on printed route maps, on maps posted in bus shelters, and on decals posted on fareboxes and vehicles. While most of SFMTA's public information notes that reduced fares are available to seniors, persons with disabilities, and Medicare card holders, the shelter maps and the vehicle and farebox decals omit information about the Medicare half fare. FTA requires that the Medicare half-fare be included whenever other fare information is made available to the public.

In response to the draft report, SFMTA submitted to FTA revised shelter maps and decals that included all required fare information. The shelter maps will be printed and installed by September 2010 and the decals will be replaced during the SFMTA's next decal campaign. This finding is closed.

15. ADA

Basic Requirement: Titles II and III of the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 provide that no entity shall discriminate against an individual with a disability in connection with the provision of transportation service. The law sets forth specific requirements for vehicle and facility accessibility and the provision of service, including complementary paratransit service.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for ADA.

16. Charter Bus

Basic Requirement: FTA grantees are prohibited from using Federally funded equipment and facilities to provide charter service if a registered private charter operator expresses interest in providing the service. Grantees are allowed to operate community based charter services excepted under the regulations.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for charter bus.

17. School Bus

Basic Requirement: Grantees are prohibited from providing exclusive school bus service unless the service qualifies and is approved by the FTA Administrator under an allowable exemption. Federally funded equipment or facilities cannot be used to provide exclusive school bus service. School tripper service that operates and looks like all other regular service is allowed.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for school bus.

18. National Transit Database (NTD)

Basic Requirement: Grantees that receive 5307 and 5311 grant funds must collect, record, and report financial and non-financial data in accordance with the Uniform System of Accounts (USOA) and the *National Transit Database (NTD) Reporting Manual* as required by 49 USC 5335(a).

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for National Transit Database.

19. Safety and Security

Basic Requirement: Any recipient of Urbanized Area Formula Grant Program funds must annually certify that it is spending at least one percent of such funds for transit security projects or that such expenditures for security systems are not necessary.

Under the safety authority provisions of the Federal transit laws, the Secretary has the authority to investigate the operations of the grantee for any conditions that appear to create a serious hazard of death or injury, especially to patrons of the transit service. States are required to oversee the safety of rail fixed guideway systems through a designated oversight agency, per 49 CFR Part 659, Rail Fixed Guideway Systems, State Safety Oversight. FTA has developed web sites for Bus Safety and Rail Safety. These sites include helpful tools, such as resources, self assessments, and forums.

Under security, a list of 17 Security and Emergency Management Action Items has been developed by FTA and the Department of Homeland Security's Transportation Security Administration (TSA). This list of 17 items, an update to the original FTA Top 20 security action items list, was developed in consultation with the public transportation industry through the Mass Transit Sector Coordinating Council, for which the American Public Transportation Association (APTA) serves as Executive Chair. Security and Emergency Management Action Items for Transit Agencies aim to elevate security readiness throughout the public transportation industry by establishing baseline measures that transit agencies should employ. Additionally, FTA has developed an extensive website for transit security.

The goal of FTA's Safety and Security Program is to achieve the highest practical level of safety and security in all modes of transit. To this end, FTA continuously promotes the awareness of safety and security throughout the transit community by establishing programs to collect and disseminate information on safety/security concepts and practices. In addition, FTA develops guidelines that transit systems can apply in the design of their procedures and by which to compare local actions. Many of the questions in this review area are designed to determine what efforts grantees have made to develop and implement safety, security, and emergency management plans. While there may not be specific requirements associated with all of the questions, grantees are encouraged to implement the plans, procedures, and programs referenced in these questions. For this reason, findings in this area will most often result in advisory comments rather than deficiencies.

Findings: A summary of SFMTA's expenditures of Section 5307 funds for security projects is provided in Section VI of this report.

During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for safety and security. The following advisory comment was made:

SFMTA has a System Security and Emergency Preparedness Plan that is still in draft form. FTA advises SFMTA to finalize the plan as soon as possible.

20. Drug-Free Workplace

Basic Requirement: FTA grantees are required to maintain a drug-free workplace for all employees and to have an ongoing drug-free awareness program.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for drug-free workplace.

21. Drug and Alcohol Program

Basic Requirement: Grantees receiving Urbanized Area Formula Program (Section 5307), Non-Urbanized Area Formula Program (Section 5311), or Capital Investment Program (Section 5309) funds must have a drug and alcohol testing program in place for all safety-sensitive employees.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for the drug and alcohol program. SFMTA's Substance Abuse Policy was revised prior to the site visit to incorporate the amendments to 49 CFR Part 40 that were effective in 2008 and additional regulatory changes that will take effect in October 2010 but the policy still needed to be approved by the Board and distributed to all safety sensitive employees. The staff reported that the revised policy was scheduled to be approved by the SFMTA Board at its June 15th meeting.

On June 17th, SFMTA notified FTA that the Board had approved the revised Substance Abuse Policy and distribution to all safety sensitive employees was underway. This finding is closed.

22. Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO)

Basic Requirement: The grantee must ensure that no person in the United States shall on the grounds of race, color, religion, national origin, sex, age, or disability be excluded from participating in, or denied the benefits of, or be subject to discrimination in employment under any project, program, or activity receiving Federal financial assistance from the Federal transit laws. (Note: EEOC's regulation only identifies/recognizes religion and not creed as one of the protected groups.)

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for EEO.

23. ITS Architecture

Basic Requirement: Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) projects funded by the Highway Trust Fund and the Mass Transit Account must conform to the National ITS

Architecture, as well as to United States Department of Transportation (USDOT) adopted ITS Standards.

Findings: During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for ITS architecture.

24. American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (ARRA)

Basic Requirement: Grantees must have the legal, financial, and technical capacity to carry out the proposed program of projects and meet the additional reporting requirements for its ARRA-funded grant activities.

Findings: SFMTA has two active ARRA grants. Grant CA-96-X014 is funding light rail equipment, bus yard workstations, facility maintenance and rehabilitation, capital planning and grants management software, bus rehabilitation, change machines, cable car kiosks, control center equipment, fare collection equipment, and LRV reconditioning and rebuilding. Grant CA-66-X008 is for supplemental preventive maintenance.

During this Triennial Review of SFMTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for ARRA.

V. SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND CORRECTIVE ACTIONS

Review Area	Finding	Deficiency	Corrective Action	Response Date	Date Closed
1. Legal	ND				
2. Financial	ND				
3. Technical	ND				
4. Satisfactory Continuing Control	ND				
5. Maintenance	D-07	Late facility/equipment preventive maintenance	Submit to FTA three months of preventive maintenance records for overhead wire and visual ground inspections showing that 80 percent of these inspections have been completed on tim	9/24/2010	
6. Procurement	ND				
7. Disadvantaged Business Enterprise	ND				
8. Buy America	ND				
9. Debarment and Suspension	ND				
10. Lobbying	ND				
11. Planning/POP	ND				
12. Title VI	ND				
13. Fare Increases and Service Reductions	ND				
14. Half Fare	D-06	Information incomplete regarding Medicare cardholders	Report to FTA on how and when shelter maps and decals will be modified to comply with Medicare half fare requirements. Submit sample copy of revisions.	9/24/2010	6/7/2010
15. ADA	ND				
16. Charter Bus	ND				
17. School Bus	ND				
18. National Transit Database	ND				
19. Safety and Security	ND				
	AC-10	Security plans not up-to-date	Finalize and adopt draft System Security and Emergency Preparedness plan		
20. Drug-Free Workplace	ND				
21. Drug and Alcohol Program	D-03	Policy out of date	Report to FTA that revised policy has been approved by Board and distributed to all safety sensitive employees	9/24/2010	6/17/2010

Review Area	Finding	Deficiency	Corrective Action	Response Date	Date Closed
22. Equal Employment Opportunity	ND				
23. ITS Architecture	ND				
24. ARRA	ND				

Findings: ND = No Deficiencies; D = Deficient; AC = Advisory Comment; NA = Not Applicable

VI. TRANSIT SECURITY EXPENDITURES

Does the grantee expend one percent or more of its Section 5307 Urbanized Area Formula Grant funds for transit security?

FY2007:	Yes:		No:	x
FY2008:	Yes:	x	No:	
FY2009:	Yes:		No:	x

If no, why does the grantee consider such expenditure unnecessary? (check all that apply)

	No deficiency found from a threat and vulnerability assessment
	TSA/FTA Security and Emergency Management Action Items met or exceeded
x	Other (please describe): Funds were awarded in 2007 but actual expenditures took place in subsequent years. Total amount spent in FY07- FY09 = \$3,489,400 (3.5% over three years)

Security Funding	FTA Section 5307 Funds (in Dollars)		
	FY 2007	FY 2008	FY 2009
Total amount of 5307 Funds expended	31,854,482	38,169,738	30,916,609
Amount of 5307 Funds expended on security	0	3,330,400	\$159,000
Percent of 5307 Funds expended on security	0%	8.7%	0.5%
Infrastructure/Capital Improvement Security Projects:			
Lighting, Fencing & Perimeter Control		\$2,153,000	\$65,000
CCTV and Surveillance Technology		\$664,000	\$94,000
Communications Systems		\$513,400	
Security Planning			
Drills & Tabletop Exercises			
Employee Security Training			
Other Security-Related Infrastructure & Capital Improvements (please list): _____			
Operating/Personnel Expenditures (can only be used by agencies in areas with populations UNDER 200,000):			
Contracted Security Force			
In-house Security Force			
Other Security-Related Operating Expenditures (please list): _____			

VII. ATTENDEES

Name	Title	Phone Number	E-Mail
SFMTA			
Nathaniel Ford	Chief Executive Officer/Executive Director	415-701-4720	Nathaniel.ford@sfmta.com
Sonali Bose	CFO	415-701-4617	Sonali.bose@sfmta.com
John Haley	Director of Transit Operations	415-701-4588	John.haley@sfmta.com
Carter Rohan	Sr. Dir. Transportation Planning and Dev.	415-701-4282	Carter.rohan@sfmta.com
Dustin White	Transportation Planner	415-701-4603	Dustin.white@sfmta.com
Helen Kwan	Transportation Planner	415-701-4740	Helen.kwan@sfmta.com
Joel C. Goldberg	Fund Programming Mgr.	415-701-4499	Joel.goldberg@sfmta.com
Kate Toran	Paratransit Manager	415-701-4440	Kate.toran@sfmta.com
Peter Gabancho	Project Manager	415-701-4306	Peter.gabancho@sfmta.com
Ha Tham-Nguyen	Project Manager	415-701-4926	@sfmta.com
Lisa Chow	Project Manager	415-701-4310	Lisa.chow@sfmta.com
Ashish Patel	Contracts & Procurement	415-701-4297	Ashish.patel@sfmta.com
Shahnam Farhangi	Contract Administration	415-701-4284	Shahnam.farhangi@sfmta.com
Timothy Lipps	Superintendent, Overhead Lines	415-554-9227	Tim.lipps@sfmta.com
Ernesto Williams	Intrastructure Maint.	415-401-3157	Ernesto.williams@sfmta.com
Andre P. Boursse	Director, Contract Compliance Office	415-701-4362	Andre.boursse@sfmta.com
Annette Williams	Manager, Accessible Services	415-701-4444	Annette.Williams@sfmta.com
Bond M. Yee	Interim Dir. of Sustainable Streets	415-701-4677	Bond.yee@sfmta.com
Carl Fabbri	Sergeant	415-305-8053	Carl.fabbri@sfmta.com
Daniel Murphy	Inspector, Overhead Lines	415-554-9228	Daniel.murphy@sfmta.com
Darton Ito	Long Range Planning	415-701-4330	Darton.ito@sfmta.com
Debra Johnson	Director of Admin.	415-701-4720	Debra.Johnson@sfmta.com
Dester Rutherford	EEO and Diversity	415-701-5428	Dester.rutherford@sfmta.com
David Hill	Operations	415-695-7216	David.hill@sfmta.com
Eloida Leonardo	Financial Compliance Mgr.	415-701-4624	Eloida.leonardo@sfmta.com
Elson Hao	Fleet Renewal	415-401-3196	Elson.hao@sfmta.com
Eric Gatchalian	Grant Accountant	415-701-4520	Eric.gatchalian@sfmta.com
Fernando Urbano	Grants Acctg. Manager	415-701-4501	Fernando.urbano@sfmta.com
Frank Lau	Project Manager	415-701-4267	frank.lau@sfmta.com
Gani Soy	Sr. Admin. Analyst	415-701-4525	Isagani.soy@sfmta.com

Name	Title	Phone Number	E-Mail
Jamie Osborne	Fixed Route Accessibility Coordinator	415-701-4439	Jamie.Osborne@sfmta.com
Joy Houlihan	Deputy Director Safety, Security & Enforcement Division	415-701-5440	joy.houlihan@sfmta.com
Kate Breen	Manager, Government Affairs	415-701-4338	Kate.breen@sfmta.com
Kathleen Sakelaris	Regulatory Affairs Manager	415-706-1836	Kathleen.Sakelaris@sfmta.com
Kezia Tang	EEO Program Specialist	415-701-4406	Kezia.tang@sfmta.com
Kerstin Fraser Magary	Real Estate	415-701-4323	Kerstin.magary@sfmta.com
Kim Holman	Asst. EEO Manager	415-701-4408	Kim.holmes@sfmta.com
Leda Young	Grants	415-701-4336	Leda.young@sfmta.com
Leo Martinez	Buildings and Grounds	415-401-3108	Leo.martinez@sfmta.com
Lome Aseron	Contracts Manager	415-701-5332	Lome.aseron@sfmta.com
Margurite Fuller	Grant Procurement	415-701-4331	Margurite.fuller@sfmta.com
Mariana Valdez	Assistant EEO Manger	415-701-4405	Mariana.valdez@sfmta.com
Mary Ellen O'Brien	Safety Administrator Manager	415-701-5680	mary.ellen.o'brien@sfmta.com
Matthew Reeves	IT Mgr	415 701 4756	matthewreeves00@sfmta.com
Monique Webster	Fund Programming and Grants	415-701-4334	Monique.Webster@sfmta.com
Penny Si	EEO Program Specialist	415-701-5420	Penny.si@sfmta.com
Perry Bonelli	Buildings and Grounds	415-640-6141	Perry.bonelli@sfmta.com
Robin Reitzes	Deputy City Attorney	415-554-4260	Robin.reitzes@sfgov.org
Sandra Khaw	Grant Accountant	415-701-4521	Sandra.khaw@sfmta.com
Ted Aranas	Infrastructure Maintenance	415-401-3156	Ted.Aranas@sfmta.com
Ted Unaegbu	Manager, Security Administraton	415-554-7166	Ted.unaegbu@sfmta.com
Virgil Dennis	Maintenance Information Support	415-695-7194	Virgil.dennis@sfmta.com
Virginia Harmon	EEO Office	415-701-4404	Virginia.harmon@sfmta.com.
William "Reggie" Smith	Substance Abuse Professional	415-701-5018	Reggie.smith@sfmta.com
Win Hoblitzelle	Security Program Manager	415-701-5746	win.hoblitzelle@sfmta.com
FTA			
Jeff Davis	Program Engineer	415-744-2594	Jeffrey.S.Davis@dot.gov
CDI/DCI Joint Venture			
Nancy Coburn	Reviewer	216-570-2719	nycoburn@aol.com
David Norstrom	Reviewer	614-975-3767	dnorstrom@ee.net